

From: romolatrebilcock@sympatico.ca
on behalf of Romola <circleofallnations@sympatico.ca>

Sent: December-20-10 9:24 PM

To: jim.watson@ottawa.ca;

Marianne.Wilkinson@ottawa.ca; Eli.El-Chantiry@ottawa.ca; shad.qadri@ottawa.ca;
bob.monette@ottawa.ca; rainer.bloess@ottawa.ca; jan.harder@ottawa.ca;
Rick.Chiarelli@ottawa.ca; Diane.Deans@ottawa.ca; diane.holmes@ottawa.ca;
stephan.blais@ottawa.ca; Doug.Thompson@ottawa.ca; keith.egli@ottawa.ca;
Peter.Clark@ottawa.ca; peter.hume@ottawa.ca; allan.hubley@ottawa.ca;
maria.mcrae@ottawa.ca; mathieu.fleury@ottawa.ca; katherine.hobbs@ottawa.ca;
steve.desroches@ottawa.ca; scott.moffatt@ottawa.ca; tim.tierney@ottawa.ca;
mark.taylor@ottawa.ca; David.Chernushenko@ottawa.ca

Cc: paul@renaud.ca

Subject:Re: Missing Info on Dec 15 Staff Presentation To Council

To Members of Ottawa City Council,

I have been involved in the effort to Save the South March Highlands site since July, 2010, included mention of this at my Annual Circle of All Nations Gathering in August, and expressed thoughts in writing in late August 2010. We communicated our concern for this area to the National Capital Commission, and have encouraged them to support creative problem solving on this contentious file.

I have visited the area on a few occasions to add my tobacco to the prayer to protect this ancient, unique and very special sacred space.

I am moved by the passion that the local and extended community has expressed in its effort to protect this area from development, have followed the local newspaper coverage, and I am very interested to know more about its archaeological history, particularly with respect to the stone medicine wheel, and some stone artifacts we have seen and touched.

Indigenous Peoples have been talking about the protection of Mother Earth publicly since the formation of the United Nations, and we have suffered the commodification of countless special places, and the eradication of countless plant and animal life forms, the landscape itself, as well as our very history from the soils of America. It is no surprise to us to see the climate crisis that at this moment preoccupies the world.

It is very encouraging for me to see so many younger voices engage eloquently in this effort to protect an area that has become so special to them, and in the process, for them to discover that Indigenous history and heritage is also vitally important to them, this country's collective history, and to future generations. It is also encouraging to see the growing interest in and respect for our traditional ceremonies.

We hope Ottawa, as capital city, can play a positive influential role in a meaningful resolution of the urgent and critical environmental preservation and heritage protection issues of the South March Highlands site, including credible archaeological re-evaluation.

With respect,

William Commanda

Founder, Circle of All Nations

From: Paul Renaud [mailto:paul@renaud.ca]

Sent: December-19-10 12:50 PM

To: jim.watson@ottawa.ca

Cc: Wilkinson, Marianne (Marianne.Wilkinson@ottawa.ca); El-Chantiry, Eli (Eli.El-Chantiry@ottawa.ca); shad.qadri@ottawa.ca; bob.monette@ottawa.ca; 'rainer.bloess@ottawa.ca'; 'jan.harder@ottawa.ca'; Rick.Chiarelli@ottawa.ca;'diane.deans@ottawa.ca'; diane.holmes@ottawa.ca; stephan.blais@ottawa.ca'; Doug.Thompson@ottawa.ca; 'keith.egli@ottawa.ca'; Peter.Clark@ottawa.ca; peter.hume@ottawa.ca;'allan.hubley@ottawa.ca';'maria.mcrae@ottawa.ca';'mathieu.fleury@ottawa.c'; 'katherine.hobbs@ottawa.ca';'steve.desroches@ottawa.ca';'scott.moffatt@ottawa.ca';'tim.tierney@ottawa.ca'; 'mark.taylor@ottawa.ca'; David.Chernushenko@ottawa.ca

Subject: Missing Info on Dec 15 Staff Presentation To Council

To members of City Council,

This is to advise you that the presentation made by staff on Dec 15, 2010 appears to be incomplete. In particular the 2 slides on archaeology (attached) do not contain the following important facts regarding the Beaver Pond Forest in the South March Highlands.

The Ministry of Tourism and Culture has said (attached) that their role is simply to review the studies provided to them. The Minister of Culture said that their prior approval was based on the info available in 2004 and that any requirement for further study falls under the authority of the City.

Some might wonder if it is disingenuous for staff to stretch this interpretation to mean that the MTC sees no merit in Dr. McGhee's review. That was NOT what the Minister said and given that the Minister's letter did not even mention Dr. McGhee, it is difficult to understand how this could even be implied by the attached letter.

Under KNL's Condition 86 of subdivision approval, and in accordance with the Planning Act, the City may reasonably request that any study be redone if they have a reasonable basis for doing so. Condition 57 specifically requires KNL to perform an Archaeological Assessment – to the satisfaction of the City – as well as to the satisfaction of the MTC. It also requires that “no demolition, grading or other disturbances shall take place until any archaeological resource conservation concerns have been addressed.”

It is evident that a reasonable basis exists in light of all the NEW evidence that has surfaced since KNL's original study was done in 2004:

1. Discovery of a significant find by Ken Swayze less than 1 km away Richardson Ridge in 2006 that was refuted by the developer and is currently being disputed in court. This site was previously confirmed as 10,000 years old by Dr. Muller-Beck, Professor Emeritus of Paleohistory and Archaeology of Hunting Cultures, when he visited the site in 2007;
2. Scientific discrediting of the thoroughness of the KNL study provided by Dr. McGhee, Fellow of the Royal Society of Canada and past president Canadian Archaeological Association, in June 2010. The MTC has expressed no opinion on this review;
3. Aboriginal declaration in August 2010 by the most senior Algonquin Elder, William Commanda, that the area is significant to his people. This is the same Elder who was granted the Keys to the City of Ottawa out of respect that the city has for his position and for his contribution to preserving Ottawa's cultural heritage;
4. Discovery of a similar significant site at the same elevation less than 1 km away on Huntmar Ridge in July 2010. This has been reported to Jim Mountain but to-date nothing has been done to evaluate this site because the city has not allocated funds for such purposes – despite its obligation to do so under the Ontario Heritage Act;

5. Discovery of the stone circle in Beaver Pond Forest in 2010. The protection of the medicine wheel site will only protect the immediate vicinity (a few meters on either side of it).

Our concern is that it is highly likely that there are several other undiscovered sites nearby that may be destroyed if KNL/Urbandale is allowed to proceed. This view is substantiated by the City's own assessment in its cultural resource database that the area is high in archaeological resource potential. In fact, Mr. Mountain has wisely proposed that the City should execute an archaeological master plan for the entire Carp Ridge, including the South March Highlands.

Mary Jarvis at Urbandale has stated in the press that they will get their archaeologist to do another walk through the forest, however, what can he possibly see through the snow? It appears that KNL also plans to use the same archaeologist whose 2004 summer study effectively ignored pre-contact archaeology, according to Dr. McGhee. One might question why he would do a more thorough job in winter?

Meanwhile, city staff are inexplicably refusing to acknowledge that the KNL study needs to be redone - despite overwhelming evidence that they should do so.

It is very important for the City to insist that, in accordance with Condition 57, no site alteration (such as cutting trees and blasting) be permitted until a full and proper archaeological re-evaluation of this site has been done in the spring once the snow is gone. We strongly recommend the participation of first nations when this survey is done.

Is it too much to expect that our city responds to facts and acts responsibly on them to protect cultural heritage?

Paul Renaud

South March Highlands – Carp River Conservation Inc.